BUDGET & FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING HELD IN ROOM #318 PUTNAM COUNTY OFFICE BUILDING CARMEL, NEW YORK 10512

| Thursday | October 19, 2017 | 6:00 P.M. |
|----------|------------------|-----------|
| | | |

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 P.M. by Chairwoman Nacerino who requested Legislator LoBue lead in the Pledge of Allegiance. Upon roll call, Legislators Scuccimarra, Gouldman, Addonizio, Albano, Jonke, Castellano, LoBue, Sullivan and Chairwoman Nacerino were present. Also present was Legislative Counsel Firriolo.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that they would now review the proposed changes submitted by each Committee.

PHYSICAL SERVICES COMMITTEE (Chairman Albano, Legislators Castellano & Scuccimarra)

Item #1 - Parks & Recreation - Maintenance & Repairs - Subcontingency.

Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to move the following; seconded by Legislator Castellano.

Parks & Recreation

| | FROM: | TO: |
|---|--------|--------|
| Maintenance & Repairs 10711000 54710 | 15,000 | 0 |
| Subcontingency 10199000 54985 | 0 | 15,000 |

A DIFFERENCE OF: 0

BY POLL VOTE: ALL AYES. CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Item #2 – Planning Department – Heating Oil. Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to move the following; seconded by Legislator LoBue.

Planning Department

| | FROM: | 10: |
|----------------|--------|-----|
| Heating Oil | | |
| 10802000 54354 | 50,000 | 0 |

Heating Oil

A DIFFERENCE OF: 0

BY POLL VOTE: ALL AYES. CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

(Chairwoman Nacerino, Legislators Albano & Jonke)

Item #3 – Office for Senior Resources – Confidential Secretary – Salary Adjustment. Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to move the following; seconded by Legislator Albano.

Office for Senior Resources

FROM: TO:

Confidential Secretary

10677200 51000

(677210903) 1,627 2,127

A DIFFERENCE OF: 500

Adjust fringes and revenue accordingly.

BY POLL VOTE: EIGHT AYES. ONE NAY - LEGISLATOR LOBUE. MOTION CARRIES.

Item #4 – Highways & Facilities – Deputy Commissioner – Salary Adjustment.

Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to move the following; seconded by Legislator Castellano.

Highways & Facilities

FROM: TO:

Deputy Commissioner

10149000 51000

(149010111) 94,572 99,572

A DIFFERENCE OF: 5,000

Adjust fringes and revenue accordingly.

BY POLL VOTE: EIGHT AYES. ONE NAY - LEGISLATOR LOBUE. MOTION CARRIES.

Item #5 – Planning Department – Transportation Program Manager – Salary Adjustment. Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to move the following; seconded by Legislator Castellano.

Planning Department

FROM: TO:

Transportation Program Manager

10802000 51000

(802010106) 78,810 81,810

A DIFFERENCE OF: 3,000

Adjust fringes and revenue accordingly.

BY POLL VOTE: EIGHT AYES. ONE NAY - LEGISLATOR LOBUE. MOTION CARRIES.

OTHER BUSINESS

Item #6 – Legislature – Contract Line. Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to move the following; seconded by Legislator Jonke.

<u>Legislature</u>

FROM: TO:

Contract Line

10101001 54646 60,000 65,000

A DIFFERENCE OF: 5,000

BY POLL VOTE: ALL AYES. CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Chairwoman Nacerino asked if there were any comments.

There being no further business, at 6:05 P.M. Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to adjourn; seconded by Legislator Castellano. All in favor.

There was a constituent in the audience that wanted to make a comment.

Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to re-open the meeting; seconded by Legislator LoBue. All in favor.

Phyllis Hoenig, Mahopac Resident stated that the Legislature spoke about raises last Monday night at the Personnel meeting which she was unable to attend. She believed that the Legislator's salaries were going up 3.8% for 2018 bringing them to a total of \$40,839. She compared them to Dutchess County Legislators whose salaries as of 2017 are \$15,450 with no increase in their budget for 2018. Dutchess County's population is

259,754. By comparison Putnam County's population is 100,000. She stated that since Putnam County is so much smaller in size, she wondered about the disparity in salaries. She stated that Dutchess County has several colleges, larger towns, industry; IBM being the biggest, and therefore she believed that those Legislators deal with much bigger problems than there is in a much smaller County as Putnam. She questioned how the Legislators could justify a salary that is double the amount of Dutchess County. She stated that the Putnam County Executive's salary at \$151,600 as of 2017 is high as well compared to the Dutchess County Executive's salary at \$139,870 of 2017. She stated that our County Executive makes almost as much as Westchester County Executive Astorino. There is only \$7,544 difference and their population is 976,396. She wondered how Putnam County's salaries have gotten so high. She stated that the Legislator's job is part time and she believed that the pay scale should reflect that, as well as of a small County.

Armanda Famiglietti, resident believed that Phyllis raised important issues. She questioned when it would be proper for there to be a dialog between the citizens and voters of Putnam County and the Legislators who are making decisions on the budget.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that the Legislature just went through the budget process. She stated the different committee meetings are designed to be a venue for the public to present questions and engage in a dialogue with the members of the committee and the Legislators. She stated the committee meetings regarding the budgets were held throughout October. She stated the Legislature is now at the phase of the process where the changes that came out of the committee meetings will be reviewed and considered and then move forward. There will be a Public Hearing. She stated that nothing is final until the budget is adopted. She stated the Public Hearing is designed to hear the constituents' opinions and allows the Legislators to take those opinions into consideration before the Legislators cast their final votes.

Armanda Famiglietti, resident stated the Public Hearing is next Wednesday, October 25th and the Adopt the 2018 Budget Meeting is the next night, Thursday, October 26, 2017. She questioned if that leaves enough time for the Legislators to go back into the huge budget and give consideration to the opinions of the residents who speak at the Public Hearing.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that she is confident that they will. She stated this Legislative Board has been engaged in the dialogue of the tentative 2018 Budget throughout the month and have heard from constituents throughout the month. She stated this has been the process and procedure for many, many years, and there has never been a problem.

Armanda Famiglietti, resident stated her concern, even though Chairwoman Nacerino has stated such confidence, that the appearance is that having such a short time between the Public Hearing and the final decision that the Legislature may not really have enough time to consider all that the public has to say.

Legislator LoBue stated that there are members of the public present tonight who were unable to attend the committee meeting Monday, October 16th. She stated that she does not see what the issue would be to allow their questions to be discussed now. She stated to direct them to the Public Hearing, the situation will be the same. The public will be allowed to speak, but there will be no dialogue with the Legislators allowed. She stated that it is the job of the Legislators to answer the questions of the residents.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that she believes she has answered the questions. She stated as Chair of this committee she believes she has addressed Ms. Famiglietti concerns. She explained the process earlier in the discussion. After further discussion Chairwoman Nacerino allowed Armanda Famiglietti to present additional questions.

Armanda Famiglietti, resident questioned what was the rational to be competitive in salaries to the larger surrounding counties. She stated these are important questions that she believes the Legislature would want to answer.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated there are no reservations in speaking with the public. She explained the Legislature went through the committee process where the public has the opportunity to present their questions in a dialogue format with the committee members. She stated that this evening she is making an exception. She stated that she would like to clarify that no member of the Legislature is trying to be evasive nor is anyone trying to avoid questions. She repeated that the meeting tonight, the Budget & Finance Meeting, is a meeting where the proposed changes that came out of the committees are considered and voted upon. She stated the salary that is in place for the Legislators, with the exception of a cost of living raise for 2017 at \$703.00, has been in place since 2007. She stated that since 2007 through to 2016 there was a zero (0) increase in the Legislator salary. She stated the raise for the Legislators proposed for the 2018 budget, in her opinion, is not excessive based on the fact that there has not been a raise given in a decade. She stated if you do the full calculations, the raise being proposed is just a 1% raise. She stated that other elected officials have received increases in the past years. She stated this Legislature took a zero. She stated it was said that this is a part-time job. She stated that it may be a part-time job as stated, but it is not a part-time job. She stated that the Legislators work an inordinate amount of hours doing their job. She stated that she also believes it to be very important that the Legislature advocate for a job that is well done. She stated that she has conviction when she says one raise in ten (10) years, and probably not another raise for the next ten (10) years, is really not excessive.

Armanda Famiglietti, resident stated that is a good argument from Chairwoman Nacerino explaining it would be reasonable after so many years of not getting a raise, but an increase in compensation is usually arrived at by comparing a position to similar positions. She stated that she believes that was what Ms. Hoenig was presenting in her statement. She stated there is no parity in terms of a Legislator salary with the surrounding counties that are comparable in the population size.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that she appreciates Ms. Famiglietti's opinion. She stated in her opinion it is difficult to make that assessment with parity because if you look at the different counties there are different policies for compensation for Legislators. She stated as an example, Westchester has a base salary and then pays a stipend to each Legislator per committee that they serve as Chairperson. She stated in 2003 the Putnam County Legislator's salary was \$32,157. She stated when the question is asked "how did the salaries get to where they are", that is before the time any of the current Legislators were on this board. She explained that it was not correct to say that the Legislators do not deserve any compensation or increase.

Armanda Famiglietti, resident stated she did not say that the Legislators did not receive any compensation.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated she means an increase when she is referencing compensation.

Armanda Famiglietti, resident questioned does the pay raise apply to the County Executive as well.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated the Legislature is a separate branch of government from the Executive Branch. She stated the increase for the County Executive in the 2018 budget is a 2%. She explained that the Legislative Branch is responsible for setting its own office budget. She stated the Legislative Body is responsible for putting forth any and all budgetary changes for the County's budget.

Armanda Famiglietti, resident thanked Chairwoman Nacerino for the explanation. She stated that she would suggest that in the future when a raise is being proposed that documentation be prepared that shows the increase being proposed, the current salary and the similar salaries for the same position in surrounding counties. She stated she believes it would help prevent all of these questions.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated the comparisons were done, and the Legislature worked with the Personnel Director on this matter. She recommended that Ms. Famiglietti and Hoenig listen to the audio recording of the Budget Personnel Meeting that took place on Monday, October 16, 2017. She stated that is the meeting that questions and justifications for increases were presented. She stated that the workings of government are different from private. She stated at times it is difficult to make an exact comparison of positions.

Armanda Famiglietti, resident stated Department Heads advocate for an increase for their employees. She stated that she sees the Putnam County Residents as the bosses of the Legislators. She explained that she did not agree with the Legislator's decision stated to have the taxpayers cover a portion of a law suit against Sheriff Donald Smith.

Chairwoman Nacerino stated that was not a decision that the Legislature made lightly and there were many considerations that needed to be evaluated that were presented by legal counsel. She stated the decision made by the Legislature was in the best interest of the residents of Putnam County. She stated it is important that it be understood that the Legislature was just as uncomfortable with the decision as were members of the Public, it was a very tough decision. She stated that the matter was discussed during the committee process as well as being documented in the newspapers. She stated however back to the topic at hand, yes the members of the public are the bosses of the Legislators. She stated the residents make the evaluation and determination as whether or not the resident believes their representative should continue as their Legislative representative or any elected official. The decision of the resident is reflected in their vote during a primary and/or on Election Day.

Legislator Jonke stated that he wanted to speak as a member of the Personnel Committee. He stated although new on the Legislature he has 29 years of experience in Government. He stated that he has never heard a town and or county population used as a yardstick to measure what a salary should be. He explained it is not the process with Assessors, Tax Collectors, or Town Supervisors. He stated to use the budget of Dutchess County, which in 2017 was \$147,000,000, and in comparison the 2018 proposed budget for Putnam County is higher at \$153,000,000. He stated this little county of

Putnam County has a higher budget than Dutchess County. He stated that there are 25 Legislators in Dutchess County, there are nine (9) in Putnam County.

Phyllis Hoenig, resident stated Dutchess has a greater population, which should be taken into consideration.

Legislator Jonke stated the population is not the yardstick. He stated the tentative 2018 Budget was made public on October 2, 2017. The members of the public have had ample chance to communicate with the Legislature by email, in person and by phone. He stated as far as transparency is concerned, through the audio recordings, the videotaping and the coverage from the local newspapers, he believes this Legislature is transparent to the residents of the County.

Phyllis Hoenig, resident questioned if the Legislators have received a cost of living increase each year.

Legislator Jonke stated no, not each year.

Legislator LoBue stated as Legislator Jonke said he is one of the newest Legislators. She stated the Personnel portion of the budget is not made public, therefore the public would not be aware of the raises in the proposed budget. She stated it was not addressed by the County Executive during her presentation of the Tentative 2018 Budget on October 2, 2017. She stated the County Executive spoke to the matter that her proposed budget was a 2.2% tax increase and there was going to be additional debt service of \$350,000 and that Putnam County was under the tax cap. She stated she has been speaking for the past two (2) weeks about the, what she believes to be, huge raises. She stated that she seems to be in the minority. She stated that she knows how difficult it is for people to maintain a home in this County. She stated Putnam County is leading in foreclosures in New York State. She stated there is a big distinction between private business and government. She stated no one goes into government with the expectation that they are going to make huge salaries, the incentive is the pension. She explained to say that the Legislators deserve a raise because they have not gotten a raise, in her opinion is not justification. She stated that she does believe that the population of the County is relevant in this matter.

Legislator Albano stated there is a lot of work being done by the Legislature of Putnam County. He stated the County portion of your total tax bill is 9.1%. He stated the average portion of a County budget in New York State is 21.52%. He stated there are many vital services being provided to the residents of Putnam County with this small portion of the tax bill.

Chairwoman Nacerino provided a recap of the evaluation and reasoning which led to the proposed increase in the Legislators salary. She stated as a reminder the next public hearing will be held October 25, 2017 at 7:00p.m. in the Historic Courthouse.

There being no further comment on the proposed budget; at 6:45 P.M., Chairwoman Nacerino made a motion to adjourn; seconded by Legislator Addonizio. All in favor.

Respectfully submitted by Diane Trabulsy, Deputy Clerk.